

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

JULIA HUBBARD and KAYLA
GOEDINGHAUS,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 5:23-cv-00580-FB

TRAMMELL S. CROW, JR.,
BENJAMIN TODD ELLER, RICHARD
HUBBARD, MELISSA MILLER,
SCOTT WOODS, MRUGESHKUMAR
SHAH, MICHAEL CAIN, COE
JURACEK, PHILIP ECOB, H.J. COLE,
CODY MITCHELL, KURT KNEWITZ,
PAUL PENDERGRASS, RALPH
ROGERS, ROBERT PRUITT, SCOTT
BRUNSON, CASE GROVER,
RICHARD BUTLER, MARK
MOLINA, MICHAEL HYNES, JR.,
SHAWN MAYER, JADE MAYER,
AARON BURLINGAME; RCI
HOSPITALITY HOLDINGS, INC.,
INTEGRITY BASED MARKETING,
LLC, STORM FITNESS NUTRITION,
LLC, ULTRA COMBAT NUTRITION,
LLC, ECOLOFT HOMES LLC,
ELEVATED WELLNESS PARTNERS
LLC, DOE INDIVIDUALS 1–50, and
DOE COMPANIES 1-50

Defendants.

**DEFENDANT, MELISSA MILLER, M.D.’S ANSWER, DEFENSES AND
AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFFS’ COMPLAINT**

TO THE HONORABLE UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE:

COMES NOW, Defendant Dr. Melissa Miller (hereinafter referred to as “Dr. Miller”), and files this Answer to Plaintiffs Julia Hubbard’s and Kayla Goedinghaus’ (hereinafter “Plaintiffs”) Amended Complaint, **Dkt. No. 190**.

**I.
ADMISSIONS AND DENIALS**

1. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 1, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 2**.

2. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs’ allegations in Paragraph 2 that Codefendant Rick utilized the essential services of numerous doctors to run the Enterprise. **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 2-3**.

3. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 3, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 3**.

4. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs’ allegations in Paragraph 4 that all Defendants benefited from the Venture and/or knew or recklessly disregarded the fact that Rick used force, threats of force, fraud, or coercion to compel Hubbard and Goedinghaus to engage in commercial sex acts. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 3**.

5. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 5, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 3**.

6. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs’ allegations in Paragraph 6 that Dr. Miller committed any crime or conspired with other Defendants to commit any unlawful acts. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 3**.

7. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 7, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 3.**

8. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 8, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 3-4.**

9. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 9, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

10. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 10, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

11. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 11, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

12. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 12, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

13. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 13, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

14. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 14 that she was willing to write prescriptions based on Defendant Eller's written recommendations. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 4.**

15. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 15 that she ignored Plaintiffs' pleas for assistance; that she was informed by either Plaintiff that the medications she was prescribing were being used for an improper purpose; that Plaintiffs were being abused by Codefendant Rick; and that Plaintiffs needed help. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 5.**

16. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 16 that she was told any of the allegations made in Paragraph 15 or that she failed to take any action based on these reports, or that she prescribed drugs requested by Codefendant Eller. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 5.**

17. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 17, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 5.**

18. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 18, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 5.**

19. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 19, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 5.**

20. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 20, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

21. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 21, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

22. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 22, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

23. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 23, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

24. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 24, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

25. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 25, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

26. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 26, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

27. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 27, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 6.**

28. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 28 that the Venture required funding to pay her, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

29. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 29, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

30. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 30, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

31. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 31, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

32. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 32, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

33. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 33, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 7.**

34. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 34, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 7-8.**

35. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 35, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 8.**

36. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 36, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 8.**

37. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 37, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 8.**

38. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 38, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 8.**

39. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 39, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 8-9.**

40. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 40, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

41. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 41, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

42. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 42, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

43. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 43, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

44. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 44, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

45. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 45, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 10.**

46. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 46, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 10-11.**

47. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 47, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

48. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 48, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

49. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 49, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

50. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 50, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

51. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 51, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

52. Paragraph 52 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

53. Paragraph 53 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 11.**

54. Paragraph 54 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

55. Paragraph 55 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

56. Paragraph 56 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

57. Paragraph 57 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

58. Paragraph 58 sets forth a legal conclusion to which no response is required, and it is therefore denied. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

59. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 59, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

60. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 60, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 12.**

61. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 61, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

62. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 62, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

63. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 63, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

64. Dr. Miller admits the allegations in Paragraph 64. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

65. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 65, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

66. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 66, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

67. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 67, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

68. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 68, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

69. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 69, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

70. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 70, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

71. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 71, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

72. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 72, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

73. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 73, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

74. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 74, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

75. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 75, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

76. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 76, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 13.**

77. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 77, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

78. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 78, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

79. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 79, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

80. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 80, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

81. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 81, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

82. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 82, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

83. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 83, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

84. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 84, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

85. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 85, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

86. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 86, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

87. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 87, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

88. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 88, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

89. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 89, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

90. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 90, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 14.**

91. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 91, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 14-15.**

92. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 92, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

93. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 93, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

94. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 94, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

95. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 95, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

96. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 96, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

97. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 97, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

98. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 98, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

99. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 99, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 15.**

100. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 100, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

101. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 101 **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

102. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 102, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

103. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 103, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

104. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 104, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

105. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 105, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

106. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 106, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 16.**

107. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 107, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 16-17.**

108. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 108, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

109. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 109, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

110. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 110, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

111. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 111, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

112. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 112, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

113. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 113, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

114. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 114, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

115. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 115, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 17.**

116. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 116, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 17-18.**

117. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 117, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

118. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 118, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

119. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 119, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

120. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 120, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

121. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 121, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

122. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 122, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 18.**

123. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 123, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 18-19.**

124. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 124, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 19.**

125. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 125, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 19.**

126. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 126, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 19.**

127. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 127, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 19-20.**

128. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 128, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 20.**

129. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 129, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 20.**

130. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 130, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 20.**

131. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 131, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 20.**

132. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 132, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 21.**

133. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 133, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 21.**

134. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 134, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 21.**

135. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 135, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 22.**

136. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 136, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 22.**

137. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 137, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 22.**

138. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 138 that she was eager to write prescriptions based only on Defendant Eller's written recommendations in exchange for payments from Codefendant Rick. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 22.**

139. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 139, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 22.**

140. Dr. Miller admits the allegations in Paragraph 140. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 23.**

141. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 141 that she knowingly provided essential support to the Venture, with knowledge or at least reckless disregard of its improper activities, in exchange for financial benefit. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 23.**

142. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 142 that she was informed by Plaintiffs that the drugs she prescribed were being used for an improper purpose, that Plaintiffs were being abused by Rick, and that Plaintiffs needed help. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 23.**

143. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 143 that she was informed by Plaintiffs of the allegations in Paragraph 143 and that she simply prescribed drugs that Eller and Rick had requested. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 23.**

144. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 144 that Plaintiff Goedinghaus informed her that Codefendant Rick was withholding her medications,

physically abusing her and raping her, or that she continued to provide drugs to Plaintiff Goedinghaus with knowledge of these acts and provided no assistance. Dr. Miller denies that she committed any predicate acts under RICO. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 23-24.**

145. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 145 that she prescribed large doses of a wide variety of drugs, and that these doses and drugs should have prompted her to exercise further professional diligence, or that she ignored anything in return for continued payments from the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 24.**

146. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 146 that Plaintiffs informed her that Codefendant Rick ever withheld or stole the medications prescribed to Plaintiffs. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 24.**

147. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 147 that she had a responsibility to intervene or offer any other support to Plaintiffs, or that she was aware that Plaintiffs had no financial autonomy or were geographically isolated or that their whereabouts and communication were monitored. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 24.**

148. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 148 that the doses of medications she prescribed to Plaintiff Goedinghaus was enough to place her in reckless disregard of the fact that these drugs were being used for an improper purpose. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 24.**

149. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 149 that the three drugs prescribed presented a high risk of overdose and death and/or addiction. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 24-25.**

150. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 150, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 25.**

151. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 151, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 25.**

152. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 152, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 26.**

153. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 153, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 26.**

154. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 154, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 26.**

155. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 155, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 26-27.**

156. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 156, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

157. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 157, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

158. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 158, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

159. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 159, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

160. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 160, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

161. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 161, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 27.**

162. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 162, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 27-28.**

163. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 163, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 28.**

164. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 164, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 28.**

165. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 165, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 28.**

166. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 166, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 28.**

167. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 167, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 28.**

168. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 168, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 28-29.**

169. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 169, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 29.**

170. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 170, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 29.**

171. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 171, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 29.**

172. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 172, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 29.**

173. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 173, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 29-30.**

174. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 174, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 30.**

175. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 175, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 30.**

176. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 176, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 30.**

177. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 177, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 30.**

178. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 178, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 30-31.**

179. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 179, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

180. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 180, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

181. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 181, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

182. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 182, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

183. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 183, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

184. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 184, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 31.**

185. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 185, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 32.**

186. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 186, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 32.**

187. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 187, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 33.**

188. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 188, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 33-34.**

189. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 189, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 34.**

190. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 190, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 34.**

191. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 191, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 34.**

192. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 192, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 34.**

193. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 193, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 34.**

194. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 194, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 34-35.**

195. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 195, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

196. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 196, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

197. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 197, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

198. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 198, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

199. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 199, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

200. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 200, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 35.**

201. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 201, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

202. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 202, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

203. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 203, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

204. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 204, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

205. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 205, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

206. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 206, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

207. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 207, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 36.**

208. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 208, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 36-37.**

209. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 209, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 37.**

210. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 210, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 37.**

211. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 211, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 37.**

212. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 212, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 37.**

213. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 213, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 37.**

214. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 214, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 37-38.**

215. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 215, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

216. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 216, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

217. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 217, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

218. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 218, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

219. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 219, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

220. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 220, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 38.**

221. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 221, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 39.**

222. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 222, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 39.**

223. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 223, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 39.**

224. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 224, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 39.**

225. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 225, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

226. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 226, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

227. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 227, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

228. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 228, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

229. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 229, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

230. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 230, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 40.**

231. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 231, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 40-41.**

232. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 232, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 41.**

233. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 233, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 41.**

234. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 234, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 41.**

235. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 235, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 41.**

236. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 236, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 41-42.**

237. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 237, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

238. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 238, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

239. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 239, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

240. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 240, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

241. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 241, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

242. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 242, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 42.**

243. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 243, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 42-43.**

244. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 244, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 43.**

245. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 245, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 43.**

246. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 246, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 43.**

247. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 247, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 43.**

248. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 248, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 43.**

249. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 249, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 43-44.**

250. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 250, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 44.**

251. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 251, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 44.**

252. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 252, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 44.**

253. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 253, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 44-45.**

254. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 254, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 45.**

255. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 255, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 45.**

256. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 256, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 45.**

257. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 257, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 45.**

258. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 258, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 45.**

259. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 259, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

260. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 260, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

261. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 261, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

262. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 262, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

263. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 263, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

264. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 264, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46.**

265. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 265, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 46-47.**

266. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 266, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 47.**

267. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 267, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 47.**

268. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 268, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 47.**

269. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 269, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 47.**

270. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 270, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 47.**

271. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 271, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

272. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 272, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

273. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 273, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

274. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 274, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

275. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 275, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

276. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 276, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

277. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 277, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 48.**

278. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 278, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 49.**

279. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 279, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 49.**

280. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 280, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 49.**

281. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 281, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 49.**

282. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 282, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 49.**

283. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 283, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 49-50.**

284. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 284, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 50.**

285. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 285, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 50.**

286. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 286, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 50.**

287. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 287, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 50.**

288. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 288, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 50.**

289. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 289, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 50-51.**

290. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 290, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 51.**

291. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 291, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 51.**

292. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 292, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 51.**

293. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 293, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 51.**

294. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 294, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 51-52.**

295. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 295, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

296. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 296, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

297. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 297, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

298. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 298, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

299. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 299, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

300. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 300, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 52.**

301. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 301, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

302. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 302, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

303. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 303, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

304. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 304, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

305. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 305, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

306. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 306, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

307. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 307, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

308. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 308, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

309. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 309, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 53.**

310. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 310, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

311. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 311, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

312. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 312 that Codefendant Eller caused her to improperly issue controlled substances to the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

313. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 313 that any prescription of controlled substances by her was the foundation of unlawful activities of the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

314. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 314, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

315. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 315, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

316. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 316 that she violated the TVPA. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 54.**

317. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 317, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 54-55.**

318. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 318, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 55.**

319. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 319, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 55.**

320. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 320, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 55.**

321. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 321, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

322. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 322, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

323. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 323, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

324. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 324, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

325. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 325, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

326. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 326, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 55.**

327. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 327, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 55-56.**

328. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 328, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

329. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 329, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

330. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 330, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

331. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 331, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

332. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 332, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

333. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 333, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

334. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 334, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 56.**

335. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 335, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

336. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 336, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

337. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 337, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

338. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 338 that Codefendant Eller's recommendations made to Codefendant Rick allowed the Venture to more easily obtain controlled substances from her. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

339. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 339, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

340. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 340, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

341. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 341, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 57.**

342. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 342 that she is liable to Plaintiffs under TVPA beneficiary liability because she benefited from or participated in the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

343. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 343 that she provided assistance, support or facilitation to the Venture by prescribing controlled substances to Plaintiff Goedinghaus, or that she was aware that the Venture was forcing Plaintiff Goedinghaus to perform commercial sex acts against her will. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

344. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 344 that she received things of value from the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

345. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 345 that she knew or should have known of any trafficking acts, or that Plaintiff Goedinghaus informed her that Codefendant Rick and the Venture were forcing her to engage in commercial sex against her will. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

346. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 346 that she participated in or benefitted from the Venture, or that she knew the Venture obtained forced labor from Plaintiffs, or that she engaged in any act that constitutes labor trafficking under the TVPA. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

347. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 347, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

348. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 348, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

349. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 349, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 58.**

350. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 350, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

351. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 351, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

352. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 352, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

353. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 353, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

354. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 354, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

355. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 355, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

356. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 356, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 59.**

357. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 357, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

358. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 358, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

359. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 359, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

360. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 360, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

361. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 361, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

362. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 362, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

363. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 363, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

364. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 364, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 60.**

365. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 365, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

366. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 366, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

367. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 367, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

368. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 368, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

369. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 369, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

370. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 370, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

371. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 371, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 61.**

372. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 372, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

373. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 373, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

374. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 374, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

375. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 375, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

376. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 376, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

377. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 377, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

378. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 378, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

379. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 379, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 62.**

380. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 380, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 62-63.**

381. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 381, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 63.**

382. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 382, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 63.**

383. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 383, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 63.**

384. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 384, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 63.**

385. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 385, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 63.**

386. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 386, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 63-64.**

387. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 387, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

388. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 388, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

389. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 389, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

390. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 390, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

391. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 391, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

392. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 392, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

393. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 393, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 64.**

394. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 394, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 64-65.**

395. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 395, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

396. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 396, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

397. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 397, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

398. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 398, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

399. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 399, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

400. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 400, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 65.**

401. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 401, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

402. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 402, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

403. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 403, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

404. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 404, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

405. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 405, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

406. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 406, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

407. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 407, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

408. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 408, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 66.**

409. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 409, **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 66-67.**

410. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 410, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 67.**

411. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 411, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 67.**

412. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 412, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 67.**

413. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 413 that she committed any RICO predicate acts that proximately harmed Plaintiffs. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 67.**

414. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 414 that she engaged in any action that constitutes a violation of the TVPA or of the Controlled Substances Act. She denies that she engaged in any action that constitutes wire fraud or witness tampering. **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 67-68.**

415. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 415 that she committed any RICO predicate acts or that any such acts proximately harmed Plaintiffs or caused them to suffer financial harm. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 68.**

416. Dr. Miller lacks knowledge and information regarding the allegations in Paragraph 416 regarding the damages Plaintiffs allege they suffered, **Dkt. No. 190, p. 68.**

417. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 417 that she committed any RICO predicate acts. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 68.**

418. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 418 that she committed any RICO predicate acts. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 68.**

419. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 419 regarding Defendants corrupting any action to their criminal ends. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

420. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 420 that any predicate act occurred in August 2012. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

421. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 421 that any predicate act occurred in September 2019, or that the Enterprise is continuing. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

422. FED. R. CIV. P. 8(b) does not require an admission or denial to Paragraph 422, which does not include any specific averment or allegation. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

423. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 423 that she engaged in any action knowing that Codefendant Rick and other members of the Venture would cause Plaintiffs to engage in commercial sex acts. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

424. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 424 that she benefitted financially or by receiving something of value from participating in the Venture, or that she participated in any way in the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 69.**

425. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 425 that she violated 18 U.S.C. § 1591(a), or that Plaintiffs suffered injury or damages due to any action by her. **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 69-70.**

426. FED. R. CIV. P. 8(b) does not require an admission or denial to Paragraph 426, which does not include any specific averment or allegation. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

427. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 427 that she provided or obtained the labor or services of Plaintiffs by any means. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

428. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 428 that she benefitted financially or by receiving something of value from participating in the Venture, or that she participated in any way in the Venture. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

429. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 429 that she violated 18 U.S.C. § 1589, or that Plaintiffs suffered injury or damages due to any action by her. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

430. FED. R. CIV. P. 8(b) does not require an admission or denial to Paragraph 430, which does not include any specific averment or allegation. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

431. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 431 that she acted in violation of RICO. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 70.**

432. Dr. Miller admits the allegations in Paragraph 432. **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 70-71.**

433. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 433 that she came together with any other person to form an Enterprise, or that she was part of any such Enterprise. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

434. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations or averments in Paragraph 434 that she was part of any Enterprise. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

435. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations or averments in Paragraph 435 that she was part of any Enterprise, or that any such Enterprise committed illegal acts or violated federal laws. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

436. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations or averments in Paragraph 436 that she was part of any Enterprise. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

437. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations or averments in Paragraph 437 that she engaged in any racketeering activity. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

438. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations or averments in Paragraph 438 that she engaged in any predicate acts amounting to a pattern of racketeering activity. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

439. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 439 that she violated 18 U.S.C. § 1962(c) or that Plaintiffs suffered injury or damages due to any action by her. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

440. FED. R. CIV. P. 8(b) does not require an admission or denial to Paragraph 440, which does not include any specific averment or allegation. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

441. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 441 that she acted in violation of RICO. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 71.**

442. Dr. Miller admits the allegations in Paragraph 442. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

443. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 443 that she violated RICO by associating with others to create an Enterprise which then engaged in a pattern of racketeering activity. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

444. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 444 that she engaged in any conspiracy at any time. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

445. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 445 that she engaged in any conspiracy at any time for any financial benefit. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

446. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 446 that she committed any predicate act in furtherance of any conspiracy. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

447. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations in Paragraph 447 that she committed any predicate act in furtherance of any conspiracy, or that she committed any predicate act that caused physical or emotional injury to Plaintiffs. **Dkt. No. 190, p. 72.**

448. Dr. Miller denies Plaintiffs' allegations on pp. 72-73 of the Amended Complaint regarding damages, expenses and/or injunctive relief. **Dkt. No. 190, pp. 72-73.**

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

449. The following affirmative and other defenses are alleged on information and belief and except as expressly stated otherwise, each defense applies to the entire Complaint and to each purported cause of action or claim for relief therein alleged against Dr. Miller.

450. No assertion of any affirmative defense shall constitute either an admission that Plaintiffs do not bear the burden of proof or burden of producing evidence on any element of any cause of action or claim for relief or any issue as to which Plaintiffs bear the burden of proof or the burden of producing evidence as a matter of law, or waiver of any of Dr. Miller's right to require that Plaintiffs satisfy any burden of proof or burden of producing evidence.

451. Dr. Miller pleads that Plaintiffs' counts are barred for their failure to state a claim and the applicable statutes of limitations.

452. Dr. Miller pleads that Plaintiffs' counts are barred, whole or in part, based on no proximate cause, new and independent cause, superseding cause, intervening cause, and/or sole proximate cause. Particularly, Dr. Miller denies that any condition, conduct, action, and/or inaction, was the proximate and/or producing cause of any of the injuries, losses, adverse actions, or damages about which Plaintiffs complain. To the contrary, the purported injuries, losses, adverse actions, and damages about which Plaintiffs complain were caused: (a) by Plaintiffs' own acts or omissions, including without limitation its failure to comply with Texas law, mitigate or take available corrective or other action; and/or (b) by the conduct of third parties over whom Dr. Miller had no control and for whom Dr. Miller had no responsibility.

453. Dr. Miller pleads that Plaintiffs' claims are barred due to their failure to take reasonable and necessary steps to mitigate the alleged damages, if any, or otherwise act to avoid and reduce harm thereby implicating the doctrine of avoidable consequences. Accordingly, any recovery or relief to which Plaintiffs might otherwise be entitled, if any, must be reduced or eliminated.

454. Dr. Miller pleads the defenses of consent, legal excuse, legal authorization, privilege, and/or justification.

455. Dr. Miller pleads the one-satisfaction rule.

456. Dr. Miller pleads the defense that any claim for exemplary damages is subject to the limitations and constraints of Texas law, the Due Process Clauses of the Fifth and Fourteenth Amendments to the United States Constitution, Article I, § 19 of the Texas Constitution, and all other state and/or federal limitations on damages and exemplary

damages. Dr. Miller further affirmatively pleads that any award of exemplary damages based on the pleadings, evidence, and circumstances of this case would violate the United States for various reasons, including but not limited to the following: (a) such an award would be a vicarious award of exemplary damages for conduct of one or more others over whom Dr. Miller exercised no control and for whom Dr. Miller was not responsible, in violation of Dr. Miller's right to due process; and (b) such an award would violate the constitutional prohibitions against excessive fines.

457. Dr. Miller is entitled to dismissal of all Plaintiffs' causes of action against her on the ground that these claims are actually health care liability claims under Chapter 74 of the Texas Civil Practices and Remedies Code. Consequently, Plaintiffs' claims against Dr. Miller under the referenced federal statutes fail as a matter of law and should be dismissed with prejudice, as these statutes cannot provide remedies for alleged medical negligence.

458. Dr. Miller reserves the right to assert additional defenses if discovery indicates they would be appropriate and in compliance with the Court's then-effective scheduling order.

Respectfully submitted,

GERMER BEAMAN & BROWN PLLC

One Barton Skyway
1501 S Mopac Expy, Suite A400
Austin, Texas 78746
(512) 472-0288
(512) 472-0721 Fax

By: /s/ R. Chad Geisler

R. Chad Geisler

State Bar No. 00793793

cgeisler@germer-austin.com

Steve Dillawn

State Bar No. 05871300

sdillawn@germer-austin.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT
DR. MELISSA MILLER**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify by my signature below that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document was served on all attorneys of record on this 4th day of December, 2023.

/s/ R. Chad Geisler

R. Chad Geisler